



Review: [untitled]

Author(s): Claude Levi-Strauss

Reviewed work(s):

Marriage: Past and Present by Robert Briffault; Bronislaw Malinowski; Ashley Montagu

Source: American Anthropologist, New Series, Vol. 59, No. 5 (Oct., 1957), pp. 902-903 Published by: Blackwell Publishing on behalf of the American Anthropological Association

Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/665866

Accessed: 11/02/2009 18:14

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <a href="http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publish

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit organization founded in 1995 to build trusted digital archives for scholarship. We work with the scholarly community to preserve their work and the materials they rely upon, and to build a common research platform that promotes the discovery and use of these resources. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Blackwell Publishing and American Anthropological Association are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to American Anthropologist.

in societies. In keeping with these ends, the author has surveyed empirical studies of modern America, reviewed part of the relevant literature concerning three areas of the non-Western world (China, India, and Japan), and carefully screened the substantial body of information collected by historians and social scientists on medieval and contemporary Europe (notably France, Germany, Great Britain and Soviet Russia).

The frame of reference stems largely from the sociological formulations of Parsons and Merton, but Barber has gone beyond them in his application and refinement of constructs bearing on social stratification. His initial conception of social stratification as "the product of the interaction of social differentiation and social evaluation" provides a useful scheme for discerning the interrelations between two sets of acts within any complex society. Categories developed from this conception may well serve as guides for field studies. The discussion of social class and personality systems offers a sophisticated appraisal and should be of interest to students of personality and culture.

The strengths and the weaknesses inherent both in the basic conceptualization and in its application to actual cultures are clearly evidenced. A major strength lies in a generalized model for the assembly of a wide assortment of discrete cultural materials. Furthermore, the model helps focus attention on certain scientific problems which have been tangential or neglected in many anthropological investigations, such as the span and shape of systems of stratification and the processes of social mobility.

The chief shortcomings are manifest in the cultural assumptions which underly particular concepts built into the model. For example, the concepts of class and caste represent Western and, more specifically, American orientations and hence are not sufficiently culture free, even as ideal types, for discriminating usage in comparative studies. Significant gaps are left in the model by absence of any systematic treatment of the patterns of stratification which occur when one society is dominant and another is dominated, either between the linked societies or within either one, and by the exclusion of the forms of stratification that surround bureaucratic arrangements in all societies. Another difficulty, not of the author's making, is that sheer lack of factual information about many of the societies depicted prevents genuine comparisons of each facet of stratification; as a consequence, in a number of chapters Barber is forced to confine himself almost entirely to American data.

The book is well organized around a set of theoretical subjects and within each subject the empirical data are objectively and clearly presented. The author is at his best when dealing with American facts, for he is highly perceptive of their theoretical implications and how they fit together into a whole for a society.

Despite the major shortcomings in dealing with non-Western cultures, I deem this a worthwhile contribution to the comparative study of societies by use of sociological concepts. As research into the great civilizations of the non-Western world becomes a more central part of the anthropologist's universe of study, we shall either have to borrow from sociology or invent similar concepts independently. It would seem more economical to draw upon the mounting fund of sociological theories for the comparative study of modern societies.

Marriage: Past and Present. (A Debate between Robert Briffault and Bronislaw Malinowski.) Edited with an Introduction by Ashley Montagu. Boston: Porter Sargent Publisher, 1956. 96 pp., cloth \$2.50, paper \$1.50.

Reviewed by CLAUDE LEVI-STRAUSS, Paris, France

This unfinished controversy consists of talks given in 1931 over the BBC by Briffault and Malinowski, together with an Introduction and notes by Ashley Montagu. One

may doubt if this delayed publication was really necessary. It will certainly add nothing to either Briffault's or Malinowski's fame, as it is more a show of misunderstanding and bad faith than of anything else.

There is little doubt that Malinowski was a greater anthropologist than Briffault. However, if obliged to pass judgment on both from this booklet alone, one would probably reverse that rating. For Briffault, at least, seems to pursue a real anthropological purpose: to show that marriage has not always and everywhere existed with those characteristics which were prevalent in Western Europe by the end of the 19th century. This he does at the expense of several inaccuracies and the unproven idea that another type of marriage and family—the maternal clan—must have been prevalent in an early stage of the evolution of mankind.

Since we know very little of such a stage, his reconstruction is avowedly hypothetical. In order to disprove it, Malinowski does not hesitate to distort anthropological data, and this is all the more dangerous since he rightly claims first-hand acquaintance with those data. To say, as he does, that "the individual family has always existed and that it is invariably based on marriage in single pairs" can only be true if those words are emptied of practically all meaning. Thus, one can only expect either platitudes or misrepresentations. In both cases, one is led astray from the true road of anthropological science, which is to outline and explain differences and not to keep them hidden behind confused notions.

Varieties of Human Value. CHARLES MORRIS. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956. xv, 209 pp., illustrations, tables. \$5.00.

Reviewed by JOHN LADD, Brown University

Morris has here expanded the type of inquiry which he began in *Paths of Life* (1942). The contents of the present work consist largely of a report and analysis of the answers to a questionnaire concerning ways of life which was submitted to students in the United States, Canada, India, Japan, China (1948), and Norway. The basic document presents brief descriptions (about 150 words each) of thirteen different Ways of Life; e.g. Way 1: "preserve the best that man has attained"; Way 2: "cultivate independence of persons and things"; Way 7: "integrate action, enjoyment, and contemplation." The students were asked to rate these various Ways on a seven point scale ranging from "I like it very much" to "I dislike it very much." The distinctively new feature of this study is its extensive use of psychometric methods for analyzing the data collected. Thus, statistical techniques are used for scaling and comparing the ratings, and factor analysis is used to uncover "five dimensions of value" contained in the thirteen Ways.

After presenting the data and making a cross-cultural comparison in statistical terms, Morris proceeds to investigate possible "determinants of value" by looking for correlations; first, with cultural, social, and economic factors (from data included in the questionnaire); then with psychological factors (e.g. data obtained by the Thurstone Temperament Schedule, the Allport-Vernon study of values); and finally with biological factors (e.g. data obtained by Sheldon's techniques). Examination of these varied types of data shows that although they are significant, no one of them "accounts in any decisive manner for the ratings of the Ways" (p. 186). Hence Morris concludes that one must adopt a "field conception of values." The final chapters contain reports on additional studies involving ratings of paintings, ratings of a revised version of the original questionnaire in which "ought" is substituted for "like," and comparative data obtained from a brief questionnaire concerning "philosophic beliefs."